Photocatalysis: a promising route for 21st century organic chemistry

Giovanni Palmisano,\textsuperscript{a,b} Vincenzo Augugliaro,\textsuperscript{*,a} Mario Pagliaro\textsuperscript{b} and Leonardo Palmisano\textsuperscript{*,a}

Received (in Cambridge, UK) 10th January 2007, Accepted 9th March 2007
First published as an Advance Article on the web 4th April 2007
DOI: 10.1039/b700395c

One of the main goals of 21st century chemistry is to replace environmentally hazardous processes with energy efficient routes allowing to totally avoid the use and production of harmful chemicals and to maximise the quantity of raw material that ends up in the final product. Selective photocatalytic conversions will play a major role in this evolution and this account shows how photocatalysis is offering an alternative green route for the production of organics.

1 Introduction

Photocatalysis by polycrystalline semiconductor oxides is an unconventional technology that has traditionally been applied (sometimes coupled to other technologies) to degrade organic and inorganic pollutants both in vapour and liquid phase.\textsuperscript{1} Its main advantages consist not only in general mild conditions, but also in the possibility to abate refractory, very toxic and...
non biodegradable molecules. Many semiconductor materials have been tested as photocatalysts but it is generally accepted that TiO$_2$, due to its low cost and high activity and stability under irradiation, is the most reliable material.

Applications of heterogeneous photocatalysis as a synthetic route have also been tested but they are less common because semiconductor photocatalytic reactions have always been considered as highly unselective processes, especially in water. Nevertheless many selective reactions were carried out by employing not only titanium dioxide, but also other semiconductors and silica. On the other hand, a number of selective syntheses mediated by different irradiated organic species have been studied.

Increasingly stringent environmental limitations for chemical processes are driving researchers to find alternative synthetic routes based on heterogeneous, leach-proof catalysts affording high yields of the wanted product in environmentally benign solvents such as water or (supercritical) carbon dioxide. As recent literature shows, organic chemistry is moving this way as well, bearing in mind that, in many cases, both water-soluble and water-insoluble molecules can react faster in water and, sometimes, higher reaction rates are found with water-insoluble substrates.

In this scenario new perspectives are open for the development of medium to large-scale green photocatalytic processes in the synthesis of a number of organic species, widely used in pharmaceutical, food and cosmetic industries.

The advantages of these different types of reactions, especially when carried out in organic-free solvents, are massive: only consider the possibility to avoid environmentally and unhealthy dangerous heavy metal catalysts, strong chemical oxidant/reducing agents and the benefit coming from the use of the sun as a free green light source.

In this feature article we report several studies on photocatalytic selective reactions, both in gas and in liquid media. Some organic syntheses here cited produced only micro to millimolar amounts of chemicals; even if they have been performed on a more analytical than on a preparative scale, they merit to be mentioned as the related investigations strongly demonstrate the synthetic ability of photocatalysis.

Most of studies report on oxidations or reductions. In the former case hydrocarbons and alcohols mainly have been oxidised, in the latter case CO$_2$ conversion to useful organics along with some nitrogen-containing organics reductions have been intensively investigated.

Among the employed photocatalysts, SiO$_2$ and semiconductors such as TiO$_2$, ZnO, WO$_3$, CdS and NiO are very common. These catalysts are often metal-doped in order to shift the radiation absorption towards higher wavelengths and supported over various materials (e.g. silica and zeolites) in order to increase the surface area and hence the reaction rate. Similarly inorganics like uranyl(VI) and polyoxometalates are extensively applied along with various organic compounds. Porphyrins and phthalocyanines are organic species with large potential as selective photocatalysts.

This article emphasises the recent advances on selective photocatalytic conversions of interest for organic chemistry and ends with economic considerations of practical utility in evaluating application of these types of reaction.

**Fig. 1** Representation of a semiconductor-photocatalyzed reaction.

**Fig. 2** Band gaps and redox potentials (vs. NHE) at pH = 1.
Compared to its crystalline analogue, poorly crystalline TiO$_2$ (excitation wavelength, $\lambda_{\text{exc}} = 385$ nm) improves significantly its selectivity in some partial oxidations.$^4$ Many types of highly dispersed metal oxide species on supports such as SiO$_2$ and Al$_2$O$_3$/SiO$_2$ as well as mixed oxides and zeolites exhibit good selectivities for partial oxidations. This is ascribed to the high dispersion of photoactive sites, surrounded by insulator supports, so that the exciton is localized and isolated.$^{2b}$

An example of a homogeneous inorganic catalyst is represented by UO$_2^{2+}$ ($\lambda_{\text{exc}} = 385$ nm), which absorbs visible light to produce a long-lived, strongly oxidizing excited state, $^*\text{UO}_2^{2+}$, which is capable$^4$ to catalyse the aerobic oxidation of cyclopentane to cyclopentanone:

$$\text{UO}_2^{2+} + h\nu \rightarrow ^*\text{UO}_2^{2+}$$

$$^*\text{UO}_2^{2+} + \text{C}_5\text{H}_{10} \rightarrow \text{UO}_2^{2+} + \text{C}_5\text{H}_9^+ + \text{H}^+$$

$$\text{C}_5\text{H}_9^+ + \text{O}_2 \rightarrow \text{C}_5\text{H}_8\text{O}_2^-$$

$$\text{C}_5\text{H}_8\text{O}_2^- \rightarrow \text{C}_5\text{H}_6\text{O} + 1/2\text{H}_2\text{O}_2$$

$$2\text{UO}_2^{2+} + \text{O}_2 + 2\text{H}^+ \rightarrow 2\text{UO}_2^{2+} + \text{H}_2\text{O}_2$$

Polyoxometalates (POMs) also induce reversible redox reactions upon irradiation, acting as multielectron and oxygen relays.$^6$ The reaction route commonly proposed for the conversion of organic substrates (mainly alcohols) is H-abstraction, as shown in the case of 2-propanol oxidation:

$$\text{POM} + h\nu \rightarrow \text{POM}^*$$

$$\text{POM}^* + \text{Me}_2\text{CHOH} \rightarrow \text{POM} (e^-) + \text{Me}_2\text{COH}^- + \text{H}^+$$

$$\text{POM} + \text{Me}_2\text{COH}^- \rightarrow \text{POM} (e^-) + \text{Me}_2\text{CO} + \text{H}^+$$

Finally, phthalocyanine and porphyrin complexes have been widely studied as photocatalysts for hydrocarbon aerobic oxidation such as in the case of iron(III) mesotetraakis(2,6-dichlorophenyl)porphyrin (Fig. 3), working in aqueous solutions of appropriate surfactants to form micelles, where the oxygenation of alkenes to epoxides smoothly takes place.$^7$

![Fig. 3](image-url)

**Fig. 3** Iron(III) mesotetraakis(2,6-dichlorophenyl)porphyrins.$^7$

### 3 Oxidation reactions

Photooxidation is by far the most studied reaction class. In photocatalytic reactions carried out in non-aqueous systems it is usual to obtain rather high chemical yields of oxidation products, although sometimes with very low quantum yields/efficiencies (especially in the case of semiconductors). Industrial processes for oxidation reactions have generally been conducted using stoichiometric amounts of heavy metal reagents (e.g. Cr and Mn salts or V$_2$O$_5$) or moisture-sensitive oxidants.$^3$

Most studies dealt with aliphatic and aromatic alkanes and alkene derivatives and particular attention has been devoted to the selective oxidation of alcohols to carbonyls.

#### 3.1 Aromatic hydroxylation

The hydroxylation of aromatics is of particular interest to the chemical industry. Hydroquinone, for example, is a widely used commercial chemical. A typical industrial process for hydroquinone production is based on the oxidation of aniline by manganese dioxide and sulfuric acid. This is then followed by reduction typically using Fe/HCl.

This process is not atom efficient (i.e., only a modest part of the atoms consumed in the process are present in the final product) and generates a massive quantity of wastes (namely iron(II) oxide, manganese sulfate, ammonium sulfate).

One of the greatest advances in catalysis since the early 1980s was the discovery of titanium silicate catalysts by chemists at Enichem (Italy). These versatile oxides already have a wide range of industrial applications including epoxide formation, ammoximation and hydroxylation.$^{3c}$ In particular they are used for the production of dihydroxylated benzenes, by using hydrogen peroxide.

Among photocatalytic aromatics oxidations,$^8$-12 the conversion of benzene to phenol is perhaps the most interesting reaction, since the latter is widely used as a disinfectant, precursor of resins and preservative for pharmaceutical aid. Hence its yearly global production amounts to ca. $5 \times 10^6$ tonnes yr$^{-1}$. A recent heterogeneous photocatalytic oxidation of benzene to phenol$^9$ in water–acetonitrile suspensions reaches 11% yield by employing TiO$_2$ along with polyoxometalate PW$_{12}$O$_{40}^{3-}$. The secondary products are hydroquinone and catechol.

Attempts to selectively oxidise benzene were also carried out with transition metal-exchanged BEA zeolites dispersed in benzene–acetonitrile–water mixtures,$^9$ and by means of UO$_2^{2+}$ and H$_2$O$_2$ affording phenol with an optimal quantum yield of 0.7.$^{10}$

Similarly, TiO$_2$-catalyzed photocatalysis can be used to obtain mono-hydroxylated aromatic derivatives in fairly to good yields.$^{11,12}$ Under irradiation, the aromatic compounds adsorbed on the catalyst surface undergo two competing reaction pathways: (i) hydroxylation of the aromatic ring or, (ii) multi-step oxidation reactions to complete mineralization. Scheme 1 shows that, in the case of compounds containing an electron donor group, the OH radical attack follows the selectivity rules known for homogeneous electrophilic aromatic substitution, obtaining the only ortho- and para-isomers. In the absence of an electron donor group, instead, the attack is unselective, and a mixture of all the three possible isomers is
Ethylbenzene Acetophenone 100 7

Table 1  Liquid-phase photocatalyzed oxidation of hydrocarbons 

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Substrate</th>
<th>Product</th>
<th>Selectivity (mol%)</th>
<th>Conversion (mol%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Toluene</td>
<td>Benzaldehyde</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Benzoic acid</td>
<td>91</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyclohexane</td>
<td>Cyclohexanol</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cyclohexanone</td>
<td>44</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2-Cyclohexanone</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1,1-Bicyclohexane</td>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methylcyclohexane</td>
<td>1-Methylcyclohexanol</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2-Methylcyclohexanol</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3-Methylcyclohexanol</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4-Methylcyclohexanol</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2-Methylcyclohexane</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3-Methylcyclohexane</td>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4-Methylcyclohexane</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1-Methanolcyclohexane</td>
<td>56</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethylbenzene</td>
<td>Acetophenone</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As far as the cyclohexanone formation is concerned the authors hypothesised the subsequent reactions:

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{RH} + \cdot \text{OH} & \rightarrow \text{RHOH} \\
\text{RH} + \text{O}_2 & \rightarrow \text{RHO'O'} \\
\text{RHO'O'} + \text{RH}_2 & \rightarrow \text{RHOOH} + \text{HR'} \\
\text{RHOOH} + e^- & \rightarrow \text{RHO'} + \text{OH}^- \\
\text{RHO'} + \text{RH}_2 & \rightarrow \text{RHOH} + \text{HR'} \\
\text{RHO} + \text{O}_2 & \rightarrow \text{RO} + \text{OH}^- \\
\text{RHO} + \text{HO}_2 & \rightarrow \text{RO} + \text{H}_2\text{O} \\
\end{align*}
\]

TiO\textsubscript{2} film reactors were used for the partial oxidation of cyclohexane in gas phase as well.\textsuperscript{16} The films were prepared via four different methods (dip coating using titanium isopropoxide and commercially available titanium dioxide particles, sol–gel process, and flame aerosol process) and irradiated with UV-light. Best results in terms of activity for the formation of cyclohexanol and cyclohexanone (expressed in \(\mu\)mol per gram of catalyst per minute) were those of flame aerosol films, reaching the value of 0.964 \(\mu\)mol g\(^{-1}\) min\(^{-1}\), with a selectivity towards the two products of 98%. The best selectivity was 99%, achieved with films obtained by the sol–gel method, but in this case the activity value was very low, 0.025 \(\mu\)mol g\(^{-1}\) min\(^{-1}\).

Transition metal oxides systems have also been often used aiming to selectively photooxidise hydrocarbons to the respective alcohols, aldehydes and ketones. Recent results with sol–gel silica-entrapped Cr employed in the partial oxidation of cyclohexane under visible-light irradiation\textsuperscript{18} in acetonitrile indicate that the highest turnover number (2.5) and selectivity (68%) for cyclohexanone production were obtained with catalyst containing 0.1% Cr when only traces of CO\textsubscript{2} were detected. Even if some TiO\textsubscript{2} systems show higher selectivity, typically considerable amounts of CO\textsubscript{2} are formed whereas these Cr-silica systems prevent cyclohexane decomposition. The silica-entrapped Cr catalyst, characterized by nylon polymers. The product formation rate notably increases by employing a solvent that does not compete with cyclohexane over the active reaction sites. Moreover the rate was also enhanced by solvents, such as dichloromethane, that were strongly adsorbed and formed reactive radicals on irradiated TiO\textsubscript{2}. Dichloromethane was the best solvent with regard to the formation rate of cyclohexanol and cyclohexanone. The most unfavourable solvents were isopropanol, chloroform and benzene; the first and the second ones adsorbed quite strongly on TiO\textsubscript{2} forming radicals reacting with other solvent molecules.

The proposed reaction mechanisms for the formation of cyclohexanol are reported starting with the alkyl radical, which can be formed by reaction between the hydrocarbon with either a hole or a hydroxyl radical:

\[
\begin{align*}
\cdot \text{RH} + \cdot \text{OH} & \rightarrow \text{RHOH} \\
\cdot \text{RH} + \text{O}_2 & \rightarrow \text{RHO'O'} \\
\text{RHO'O'} + \text{RH}_2 & \rightarrow \text{RHOOH} + \text{HR'} \\
\text{RHOOH} + e^- & \rightarrow \text{RHO'} + \text{OH}^- \\
\text{RHO'} + \text{RH}_2 & \rightarrow \text{RHOH} + \text{HR'} \\
\end{align*}
\]
diffuse-reflectance spectroscopy, showed three distinct absorption bands at 245, 330 and 460 nm, assigned to ligand-to-metal charge transfer from $\text{O}_2^-$ to Cr$^{6+}$ transitions of chromate species, which are highly dispersed on silica matrixes and isolated from each other. Increasing the Cr content resulted in red-shifted absorption at 500–800 nm, which could be assigned to the d–d transition of octahedral Cr$^{3+}$ in the Cr$_2$O$_3$ cluster, indicating that these catalysts contained polymerized Cr$^{3+}$ species.

Aerobic visible-light photocatalytic selective oxidation of various hydrocarbons (see Table 2) by a photo-stable diiron(III) bisporphyrin complex ($\lambda_{\text{exc}} = 425$ nm) was recently reported to proceed with high turnover numbers and complete selectivities.\textsuperscript{19} The conversion of toluene to benzaldehyde, followed by measuring the solution absorption, is qualitatively shown in Fig. 4, along with the redox cycle of the catalyst. The main drawback of this oxidation is represented by the use of the unsafe solvent pyridine in the photoreactions.

The simplest hydrocarbon, methane, is a valued, abundant fuel, whose oxygenate derivative methanol can be used as building block for a variety of chemicals.\textsuperscript{21} The major source of methane is natural gas, which is copiously present in nature. Industrial processes usually convert natural gas to synthesis gas (a mixture of CO and H$_2$), formed through a process known as steam reforming, carried out under severe temperature conditions (973–1373 K). Synthesis gas, once obtained, may be used to produce methanol which in turn is used to synthesise crucial compounds as formaldehyde, acetic acid, and MTBE (methyl tert-butyl ether). The latter, for instance, is used as an additive to produce cleaner burning gasoline. Methanol itself is employed as a fuel source in fuel cells.

Low yield photocatalytic oxidation of methane has been achieved mainly by using semiconductors such as TiO$_2$, WO$_3$ and NiO.\textsuperscript{22–24} Methane conversion to methanol, hydrogen and acetic acid, by La-doped WO$_3$ in the presence of an electron transfer molecule in aqueous irradiated suspensions (at ca. 367 K)\textsuperscript{22} is thought to proceed as reported below:

$$\text{La/WO}_3 \xrightarrow{h_{\nu, >410 \text{ nm}}} \text{e}^-_\text{cb} + \text{h}^+_\text{vb}$$
$$\text{e}^-_\text{cb} + \text{MV}^{2+} \rightarrow \text{MV}^+$$
$$\text{h}^+_\text{vb} + \text{H}_2\text{O} \rightarrow \text{H}^+ + \text{'}\text{OH}$$
$$\text{MV}^+ + \text{H}^+ \rightarrow 1/2 \text{H}_2 + \text{MV}^{2+}$$
$$\text{CH}_4 + \text{'}\text{OH} \rightarrow \text{CH}_3\text{'} + \text{H}_2\text{O}$$
$$\text{CH}_3\text{'} + \text{H}_2\text{O} \rightarrow \text{CH}_3\text{OH} + 1/2 \text{H}_2$$

where MV stands for methyl viologen. Conversion of methane is low (ca. 4 and 10% in the presence of hydrogen peroxide) and no reaction is observed at room temperature. A significant advancement then uses\textsuperscript{23} methane hydrates (see Fig. 5), now obtaining significant conversions even at very low temperatures (268 K). Methane hydrates form in the ocean at depths between ca. 280 and 4000 m enabling higher concentrations of methane in water, higher even than that obtained in water–methane pressurised systems. Hence the produced methanol in this case was more than four-fold than that of the methane–water system. The author also observed that irradiating the suspensions with UV-vis rather than visible light lowered the quantity of alcohol, causing an overoxidation of methanol.

![Fig. 4](image-url)  
**Fig. 4** Time course of the changes in the absorption profile accompanying the photoconversion ($\lambda = 425$ nm) of anaerobic pyridine solutions of (DPDF)Fe$_2$O (7 x 10^{-6} M) in the presence of toluene (1.0 M) at room temperature. (Reprinted with permission from ref. 19. Copyright 2006, American Chemical Society.)

![Fig. 5](image-url)  
**Fig. 5** Structure of methane hydrate.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Substrate</th>
<th>Product(s)</th>
<th>Turnover number$^{ab}$</th>
<th>Selectivity$^b$ (mol%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Toluene</td>
<td>Benzaldehyde</td>
<td>76 ± 11</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumene</td>
<td>Acetophenone</td>
<td>143 ± 10</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cunyl alcohol</td>
<td>116 ± 14</td>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diphenylmethane</td>
<td>Benzophenone</td>
<td>160 ± 25</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dihydroanthracene</td>
<td>Anthracene</td>
<td>235 ± 37</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fluorene</td>
<td>Fluorenone</td>
<td>287 ± 34</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$^a$ Turnover number represents the total moles of product per mole of catalyst. $^b$ Values obtained after 18 h photolysis.

Table 2  Turnover numbers and selectivities for hydrocarbon photocatalytic oxidation\textsuperscript{19}
Table 3 Irradiation of acetonitrile solutions of benzyl alcohol (100 mM) in the presence of catalytic concentrations of the anions [S$_2$M$_{18}$O$_{62}$]$^{4-}$ (M = W, Mo)$^{26}$

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Complex [mol%]</th>
<th>Light source$^c$ (irrad. time)</th>
<th>Conversion (%)</th>
<th>Aldehyde yield (mol%)</th>
<th>Acid yield (mol%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S$<em>2$W$</em>{18}$O$_{62}$$^{4-}$ [2.0]</td>
<td>Solar light [25 days]</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S$<em>2$Mo$</em>{18}$O$_{62}$$^{4-}$ [4.0]</td>
<td>Solar light [25 days]</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Negligible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S$<em>2$W$</em>{18}$O$_{62}$$^{3-}$ [1.9]$^b$</td>
<td>12.5 W [48 h]</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$^a$ Concentrations for the last entry were: 79 mM benzyl alcohol and 1.52 mM [S$_2$M$_{18}$O$_{62}$]$^{4-}$.

$^b$ Artificial light: $\lambda = 312$–700 nm.

3.3 Alcohol oxidation

A number of new efficient processes for aerobic alcohol oxidation to carbonyl compounds mostly based on Ru and Pd–Au have been recently developed.$^{25}$ By photocatalysis, promising results in the oxidation of aromatic alcohols make use of heteropolyoxometalates catalysts of the form [S$_2$M$_{18}$O$_{62}$]$^{4-}$ (M = W, Mo) irradiated both by solar and UV-vis light in acetonitrile.$^{26,27}$ Results (Table 3) point to good activity and yield of S$_2$W$_{18}$O$_{62}$$^{4-}$ with both solar and UV-vis light, whereas S$_2$Mo$_{18}$O$_{62}$$^{4-}$ gave very low conversion.

Even better, a large variety of aromatic alcohols can be successfully converted in yields ranging from 50 to 97%$^{27}$ using a heterogeneous catalyst (H$_3$PW$_{12}$O$_{40}$/SiO$_2$) with O$_2$ as the unique oxidising agent. Notably no overoxidation to carboxylic acids was observed and the catalyst was proved to be leach-proof.

At room temperature and under visible light irradiation the solvent-free oxidation of benzyl alcohol to benzaldehyde by 9-phenyl-10-methylacridinium perchlorate as photocatalyst proceeds with O$_2$ as unique oxidant$^{28}$ with 35 ± 5% quantum yields. The reaction mechanism (Scheme 2) involves the photoactive species AcrPh$^+$ that under irradiation converts into the singlet excited state 1AcrPh$^+$*, which is further quenched by electron transfer from the alcohol in the solvent cage, yielding AcrPh$^-$ and PhCH$_2$OH$^+$. The latter undergoes fast deprotonation producing PhCH(OH)$^-$ that reacts with O$_2$ to afford PhCHO and HO$_2$$^-$. Subsequently the protonation of HO$_2$$^-$ and the regeneration of AcrPh$^+$ occur, thus closing the cycle.

Selectivity of photooxidation of alcohols to the corresponding aldehydes and ketones was performed either in gas phase$^{29}$ or in liquid phase using acetonitrile as solvent$^{27,30}$ or without solvent.$^{31}$ The first remarkable selective photocatalytic oxidation of alcohols to aldehydes in water$^2$ at room temperature concerns the selective oxidation of 4-methoxybenzyl alcohol to the corresponding aldehyde in water suspensions of home-prepared TiO$_2$. 4-Methoxybenzaldehyde (or p-anisaldehyde) is a fragrance and an intermediate in many different industrial processes. The nanostructured catalyst synthesised by boiling aqueous solutions of TiCl$_4$ in mild conditions, showed a yield much higher (42% mol for conversions of ca. 65%) than that obtained with TiO$_2$ commercial samples (see Table 4). The only by-products present were traces of 4-methoxybenzoic acid (only for long-lasting runs) and opening products, CO$_2$ being the other main oxidation product.

UV-vis light was used to compare the various catalysts for reproducibility reasons, but similar selectivities were observed in experimental runs performed by solar light.

Results are summarised in Table 4. Two commercial TiO$_2$ samples were compared with home-prepared (HP) catalysts obtained by simply boiling TiCl$_4$ solution for different times. Increasing the boiling time resulted in a higher crystallinity and activity of the catalyst, which afforded progressively lower yields in aldehyde due to a higher production of CO$_2$. Selectivity values obtained with commercial catalysts drastically decreased with irradiation time and decreasing the catalyst amount of commercial samples did not result in significant enhancement of selectivity to aldehyde. Conversely the poorly crystalline home-prepared samples gave rise to yields of ca. 35% even when the conversion was ca. 80%. Finally no catalyst deactivation was observed by the authors in any case.

Various aliphatic and aromatic alcohols (e.g. 1-pentanol, cyclohexanol, benzyl alcohol, 1-phenylethanol) can be aerobically oxidised to the corresponding carboxyls by using light-activated TiO$_2$ in an annular gas phase reactor at ca. 463 K in moderate yield (37%) but with selectivities >95%.$^{29}$ Oxidation of 1-phenylethanol notably gave styrene (with a selectivity of 87% and a conversion of 97%).

Table 4 Photocatalytic oxidation of 4-methoxybenzyl alcohol to aldehyde. Alcohol initial concentration: 1 mM$^5$

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Catalyst$^a$</th>
<th>Boiling time/h</th>
<th>SSA$^b$/ m$^2$ g$^{-1}$</th>
<th>Irrad. time/h</th>
<th>Yield$^c$ (mol%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TiO$_2$, Merck</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TiO$_2$, Degussa P25</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TiO$_2$ HP</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TiO$_2$ HP</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>226</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TiO$_2$ HP</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TiO$_2$ HP</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>206</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TiO$_2$ HP</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$^a$ “HP” stands for home prepared. $^b$ SSA = BET specific surface area. $^c$ These values refer to a conversion of ca. 65% and a catalyst amount of 0.2 g l$^{-1}$. 

Scheme 2 Photocatalytic mechanism of solvent-free oxidation of benzyl alcohol with O$_2$. 

3430 | Chem. Commun., 2007, 3425–3437 This journal is © The Royal Society of Chemistry 2007
3.4 Alkene epoxidation

Commercially important alkene epoxidation can be induced also photocatalytically, mostly using TiO$_2$ as catalyst and oxygen as the unique oxidant. Photocatalytic epoxidation of propene over TiO$_2$-dispersed SiO$_2$ catalysts, prepared either via impregnation or by the sol–gel process, proceeds best over the sol–gel catalyst with a 57% selectivity towards propene oxide at 9% propene conversion. Comparable conversions were obtained with the catalyst prepared via impregnation but the selectivity was only 41%.

Similar catalysts of highly dispersed TiO$_2$ in a SiO$_2$ matrix (prepared via a sol–gel method) employed in the gas phase epoxidation of styrene, afford styrene oxide along with benzaldehyde and CO$_2$. The TiO$_2$/SiO$_2$ catalysts compared with TiO$_2$ Degussa P25, gave selectivities of 62, 23 and 15% toward styrene oxide, benzaldehyde and CO$_2$ with a styrene conversion of 18% whereas the commercial catalyst degraded 95% of the substrate affording 98% CO$_2$ and 2% benzaldehyde.

Remarkable control of the chemistry by materials shape is offered by the performance of a novel catalyst made of Ti entrapped in the hexagonal channels of MCM-41 silica in the acetonitrile-assisted photocatalytic epoxidation of various alkenes. The relatively poor selectivity (ca. 60%) reached in previous studies depended on alkenes and O$_2$ radicals promoting formation of side products such as alcohols and ketones. Photocatalytic epoxidation of various cyclic and linear olefins within the porosity of the novel catalyst proceeds with unprecedented selectivity (>98%) and stereoreactivities (selectivity >99%) in the oxidation of cis- and trans-2-hexene. In Scheme 3 the three hypothesised possible reaction routes are reported (O$_2^-$ indicates lattice oxygen atoms).

In route A the direct addition of O$_3$ to cyclohexene occurs. The O$_2^-$(formed by electron transfer between O$_2^-$ and Ti$^{4+}$) acts as a positive hole. Cyclohexene radical is formed by reaction with the electrophilic O$_2^-$, which is in turn transformed in O$_2^-$ to afford allylic oxidation products (routes B and C). The influence of acetonitrile on selectivity could be ascribed to the selective suppression of the cyclohexene radical formation on the O$_2^-$ site.

4 Reduction reactions

Photocatalytic reduction is intrinsically safer compared to chemical reductions usually conducted by using harmful or environmentally unsafe species, such as iron ammonium chloride, sulfides, hydrogen, borohydrides, carbon monoxide and in general activated metals.

Yet, photocatalytic reductions are less frequent than oxidations most probably because the reducing ability of a conduction band electron is considerably lower than the oxidizing one of a valence band hole.

4.1 Nitro-aromatic reduction

Photoinduced nitro-aromatics reduction has attracted much attention. For instance, the reduction of nitrobenzene and its derivatives over irradiated TiO$_2$ surface has been largely described in the last decade.

In the conversion of nitrobenzene, 3- and 4-nitrotoluene and nitrobenzonitrile in the presence of TiO$_2$ aqueous slurries, methanol or 2-propanol play the role of electron donors and identical rates and selectivities are achieved in both cases, revealing the minor relevance of the chemical nature of the alcohol. High yields in anilines were obtained in the case of nitrobenzene and nitrotoluenes, whereas low selectivities were found in the conversion of nitrobenzonitriles.

Nitrobenzene reduction in the presence of cyclohexene induces interesting functionalisations of the nitro-organic. Nitrobenzene/cyclohexene mixtures were irradiated by UV-light at room temperature and pressure in the presence of various semiconductors (TiO$_2$, WO$_3$ and CdS). Fig. 6 represents the four identified products that amount to about 90% of the reduced substrate. I and IV were the most abundant products under homogeneous conditions, whereas II, I and III are predominant by using TiO$_2$, WO$_3$ and CdS, respectively.

No reactivity is observed without cyclohexene or irradiation. The presence of a semiconductor inhibited the formation of IV, probably because the high surface coverage by intermediates drastically reduced the chance of reaction between a

Scheme 3 Acetonitrile-assisted selective olefin epoxidation on photo-activated Ti-O$_4$ species.

Fig. 6 Products of nitrobenzene photoreduction.
reduction product of nitrobenzene, as C₆H₅NH⁺, and an oxidation product of cyclohexene, as C₆H₅CHO, that could lead to IV. Moreover the highest yield in reduced compounds was obtained by using CdS, i.e. the most powerful reducing semiconductor.

4-Nitrophenol can be reduced to 4-aminophenol with almost complete selectivities in different alcohols (methanol, ethanol, 1-propanol, 2-propanol, 1-butanol, 2-butanol)⁴⁹ in TiO₂ Degussa P25 suspensions irradiated by UV-light. The influence of solvent properties (viscosity, relative permittivity, refractive index and polarity/polarisability) on reaction rate is very impressive. Viscosity and polarity/polarisability parameter, i.e. the ability of a solvent to stabilise a charge or dipole by means of its dielectric effect, were found to play an important role in the conversion rate. An increase in the polarity/polarisability parameter corresponds to a better stabilization of the produced charged intermediate species and hence to a higher reaction rate.

Reduction of aryl azides to amines,⁴¹ photocatalysed by CdS or CdSe nanoparticles in water, takes place with high quantum yields (near to 0.5) and with almost complete selectivities towards amines, at room temperature and pressure and at neutral pH. A simplified mechanism of the reaction is depicted in Scheme 4. Sodium formate is used as electron donor (oxidised to CO₂ during the reaction).

4.2 CO₂ reduction

The environmental problems caused by the continuously increasing concentration of CO₂ in the atmosphere have brought researchers to find new solutions to convert the high amount of the exceeding CO₂ into useful chemicals. Therefore photocatalytic reduction of CO₂ by using photoactive species is clearly highly desirable.⁴²⁻⁵⁸

Previous research has shown that transition metal complexes catalyse the reduction of carbon dioxide by some hydride complexes, where the activated hydrogen is originating from water.⁴² Actually the larger part of such reactions results in a partial reduction of carbon dioxide to carbon monoxide, whereas the possibility of producing formaldehyde, methanol and methane is of particular interest because of the large use of these valued chemicals.

In photocatalysis both liquid⁴³⁻⁵¹ and gas⁵²⁻⁵⁸ systems were extensively used with different catalysts. For example, reduced high pressure CO₂ in aqueous 2-propanol solutions in which TiO₂ Degussa P25 was suspended mostly affords methane and acetone (the latter from 2-propanol oxidation).⁴³ The proposed reaction mechanism is as shown below:

\[
\text{TiO}_2 \xrightarrow{hv} e_{cb}^- + h_{vb}^+
\]

- oxidation: \( h_{vb}^+ + (\text{CH}_3)_2\text{CHOH} \rightarrow 2\text{H}^+ + (\text{CH}_3)_2\text{CO} \)
- reduction: \( e_{cb}^- + \text{CO}_2 \rightarrow \text{CO} \rightarrow \text{OH}^- \)

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{CO} + \text{OH}^- & \rightarrow 2\text{H}^+ + 2\text{e}^- \rightarrow \text{C} + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad \rightarrow \text{2H}^+ + 2\text{e}^- \rightarrow \text{CH}_2^- \\
\text{CH}_2^- & \rightarrow \text{CH}_4
\end{align*}
\]

\[
\text{CO}_2 \rightarrow \text{CH}_4 + \text{H}_2
\]

Scheme 4  Photoreduction of azides to amines by using CdS or CdSe as catalysts and sodium formate as a sacrificial electron donor.⁴¹

The major drawback of CO₂ photocatalytic reduction process lies in the rather low energy conversion efficiencies. A gain can be obtained for instance using gel films of TiO₂ nanocrystals embedded in SiO₂ matrixes (Ti/Si mole ratio = 0.1) irradiated with a UV-vis lamp (λ > 300 nm) and with 2-propanol as electron donor. The reduction of CO₂ in the presence of nitrate ions yields hydrogen, formate, CO, ammonia and urea at 10 μmol h⁻¹ when the TiO₂ present in the film was about 7.0 μmol.⁴⁵ Comparing the performance in different solvents (water, ethylene glycol, acetonitrile, sulfolane, propylene carbonate), a linear correlation between the dielectric constants and the photogenerated electrons in the formation of the various products is observed. Hence, raising the dielectric constant results in significant increase of ammonia and urea production and strong decrease of formate and CO up to negligible concentrations, thus demonstrating that the selectivity of a photocatalytic process can be easily tuned by adjusting the reaction ambient.

An improved synthesis of methanol from carbon dioxide uses UV-irradiated copper-doped commercial TiO₂ (Degussa P25), suspended in CO₂-saturated water. CuO provides the best influence on both yield in methanol (2655 mol h⁻¹) and in CO₂ (1005 mol h⁻¹) and in CO up to negligible concentrations, thus demonstrating that the selectivity of a photocatalytic process can be easily tuned by adjusting the reaction ambient.

Metal bipyridine (bpy) complexes,⁴⁹,⁵⁰ porphyrins and phthalocyanines also work as proficient catalysts for CO₂ reduction. These species are best excited by visible light. For example, high-pressure reduction of CO₂ to CO in dimethylformamide mediated by [fac-Re(bpy)(CO)₃Cl] affords an optimal yield of 99.5 μmol and a turnover number of 41.8 (mol CO mol⁻¹cat⁻¹) after 25 h irradiation at 2.45 MPa.⁴⁹ An advanced application makes use of a heterogeneous system in which [Co(bpy)]³⁺ plays the role of homogeneous catalyst and [Ru(bpy)]²⁺ is fixed to a cation exchange polymer acting as photosensitizer (Fig. 7).⁵⁰ Remarkably the reaction takes place at atmospheric pressure and temperature giving CO and H₂ as the sole products with about half the yield of the analogous homogeneous system where both the complexes were dissolved in the solvent.

The immobilization of catalysts is a major goal of current chemistry since it offers several advantages, such as avoiding a separation step from the reacting environment, thus facilitating and speeding up the catalyst reusability, which is essential.
in view of industrial applications. Aiming to this purpose, the preparation of TiO$_2$/SiO$_2$ mesoporous films ca. 50 nm thick is a noteworthy result, since higher yields and quantum yields were obtained with respect to those observed by using the same samples in powdered form. Transparent self-standing thin films prepared by a surfactant-template sol–gel process are obtained as highly ordered mesostructures, with hexagonal (Fig. 8(a)) or cubic (Fig. 8(b)) symmetries depending on the amount of water present in the starting mixture. These films, applied in the photoconversion of CO$_2$ and H$_2$O to CH$_4$ and CH$_3$OH as main products at 323 K have a high surface area (ca. 900 m$^2$ g$^{-1}$) and produced methane and methanol in ca. 70 and 15 mol g Ti$^{-1}$, respectively (after 6 h irradiation) with a total quantum yield of almost 30%. As yields drastically reduced upon grinding the films to powder the high performance is due to the pronounced absorbance of light by the shaped film.

A fixed-bed gas-solid photocatalytic reactor (see Fig. 9) was employed with commercial TiO$_2$ pellets, irradiated by UV-light, for the reduction of CO$_2$ to CH$_4$, CO and H$_2$ being the reaction by-products. The reaction was performed at room conditions at two different wavelengths: switching the light from 253.7 to 365 nm resulted in lowering the CH$_4$ concentration from 200 to 100 mg l$^{-1}$. CO was formed approximately in the same concentration as CH$_4$, while the ratio H$_2$/CH$_4$ was ca. 0.6. The authors emphasized that the presence of H$_2$ was a clear clue that the TiO$_2$ pellets also promoted water photo-splitting. Comparing the results obtained by the authors with previous studies it could be noticed that, even if their product yield seemed to be worse (0.1 mol g$_{cat}^{-1}$ after 48 h irradiation), the very low power of the lamps used must be taken into account (only 4.8 W).

Fig. 7 Representation of photocatalytic CO$_2$ to CO conversion, in which the Ru and Co complexes act as photosensitizer and catalyst, respectively. (Reproduced with permission from ref. 50. Copyright 2002, Elsevier Science B.V.).

Fig. 8 TEM images of mesoporous Ti-containing silica transparent films. (Reproduced with permission from ref. 56b. Copyright 2003, Elsevier B. V.).

Fig. 9 Schematic drawing of the experimental setup applied in the reduction of CO$_2$ in the gas phase. (Reproduced with permission from ref. 57. Copyright 2006, Elsevier B.V.).

Fig. 10 Photoactive species in the reduction of CO$_2$ to CO catalysed by MgO and UV-light. TiO$_2$ however is not the only metal oxide that catalyses CO$_2$ photoreduction in the gas phase. Photocatalytic conversion of CO$_2$ to CO over particulate MgO occurs at room temperature with a CO yield of ca. 10 mol g$_{cat}^{-1}$ (after 5 h irradiation) although in the presence of a strong UV irradiation (500 W). The reaction mechanism is supposed to involve activation of CO$_2$ adsorbed on MgO to a CO$_2$ radical by UV-light, and subsequent reduction to the surface bidentate formate (see Fig. 10), identified as the photoactive species.

5 Other reactions

TiO$_2$ and also other catalysts have been applied to many conversions, generally in organic solvent, although a few syntheses were performed in water or ethanol.

Dehydrogenation

Dihydropyrazine and 2-methylpiperazine photocatalytic syntheses were conducted over UV-irradiated semiconductor/zeolite by bubbling oxygen in alkyl diamine solution in acetonitrile. The maximum yield in dihydropyrazine (Fig. 11, I) was 20% with 2 wt% TiO$_2$ supported on Hβ (a zeolite with a ratio SiO$_2$/Al$_2$O$_3 = 20$), whereas 32% yield of 2-methylpiperazine (Fig. 11, II) was obtained with 5 wt% TiO$_2$ supported on
Hβ. In the last case piperazine (Fig. 11, III) was also formed with a yield of 15%.

Heterocycle functionalisation

Sunlight induces functionalisation of heterocyclic bases by reacting amides or ethers in water or water–acetonitrile mixtures in the presence of TiO₂. Acid and H₂O₂ assist in the reaction mechanism involving the formation of an amide radical (see Scheme 5) attacking the heterocyclic base while hydrogen abstraction is due to photocatalytically formed OH radical.

Simple production of valuable heterocyclic aldehydes by acidic hydrolysis is thus enabled by reacting heterocyclic bases (e.g. quinoline, quinaldine and lepidine) with ethers (e.g. tetrahydropyran, dioxane, dioxolane, diethyl ether and trioxane). The α-oxyalkyl radical generated either by hydrogen abstraction from the α-carbon or by electron transfer from the oxygen followed by deprotonation from the carbon α to the oxygen radical cation (Scheme 6) is responsible for the high selectivity observed and yields up to 75% are common.

One-pot cyclizations

Amino acids in deaerated aqueous suspensions of TiO₂ and CdS (Scheme 7) are successfully cyclized via a combination of oxidation and reduction with full retention of (S)-configuration in the product (pipelicolic acid) when the reaction was promoted by TiO₂ (a racemate was formed in CdS-catalysed reaction). The highest selectivity of 77% was reached with a hydrothermal crystallised TiO₂ at conversion 90%. Hence, a crucial intermediate in the preparation of biologically active heterocyclic species (used for example as anaesthetics) is directly and selectively obtained in aqueous medium.

Carbonylation

p-Nitrotoluene to carbamate conversion can be achieved at room temperature and pressure in neat ethanol, with suspended TiO₂. The reached selectivity is ca. 85% with conversions of ca. 26%. The secondary product (selectivity ca. 15%) was p-toulidine. This reaction allows one to avoid the use of a poisonous and corrosive gas such as phosgene, used in industrial preparations of aromatic isocyanates, which instead can be obtained by easy cracking of carbamates. In place of phosgene, in this reaction carbon monoxide is generated by ethanol, which is first oxidised by ‘OH to acetaldheyde, that undergoes hydrogen atom abstraction, eventually forming CO and ‘CH₃.

Coumarin compound synthesis

Irradiating solutions of phenanthrene and acetonitrile (λ > 340 nm) in the presence of TiO₂ yields a coumarin compound at room conditions, with 8% water and oxygen as oxidant. This type of compound retains appeal since they are intermediates for many chemicals, including pharmaceuticals and fluorescent dyes. The reaction mechanism is illustrated in Scheme 8 and the main product (2) was obtained with a yield of 45%. The estimated quantum efficiency is around 17% by using light of ca. 365 nm. Finally the production of 2 in this one-pot reaction is attractive because the conventional syntheses of such species from commercial compounds require many steps.

Naphthalene oxygenation

Water (containing 1% CH₃CN) and organic solvents give different selectivities in the attractive oxidation of naphthalene.
and its derivatives. In the former case 2-formylcinnamaldehydes together with 1,4-naphthoquinone were formed, with a maximum yield of 11% when conversion was ca. 50%. Conversely when using organic solvents the main product was phthalic anhydride and considerable quantities of 1,4-naphthoquinone were also formed (Scheme 9). In this case, however, the reaction rate was one order of magnitude lower probably both for a less favoured adsorption on the semiconductor and for a less efficient electron transfer. The reaction selectivity and the hypothesised mechanism suggest that in organic solvents the primary pathway is an electron transfer one, while the C–C bond breakage occurs only in water, probably because this process involves a significant charge separation.

Addition-cyclization reactions of aromatic tertiary amines

Excited semiconductors such as TiO$_2$ and ZnS have been used as photochemical sensitizers for the radical addition of tertiary amines to electron deficient alkenes. The reaction of various $\alpha,\beta$-unsaturated lactones with methylpyrrolidine was carried out with high conversion rates and yields.

In order to improve the selectivity of radical reactions in organic chemistry, photochemical methods have been efficiently tested for the stereoselective radical addition of tertiary amines to electron deficient double bonds and radical tandem reactions. In particular the diastereoselective tandem addition–cyclization reaction of $N,N$-dimethylaniline with menthylxyfuranone was performed.

Unsaturated $\omega$-amino esters synthesis

Novel unsaturated $N$-phenyl-$\omega$-amino esters can be obtained by irradiation at $\lambda > 350$ nm of silica-supported CdS methanolic suspensions. The involved reagents are methyl (2Z)-phenyl(phenylimino)acetate and various cyclic olefins (represented by RH in Scheme 10). Supporting the catalyst over silica results in a three-fold increase in reaction rate. Scheme 10 shows the main product obtained together with the only by-product. The C–C hetero-coupling steps taking place in this reaction generate two chiral carbon centers, yielding a mixture of four diastereoisomers. The highest yield (referred only to the main product) obtained was 49% and no reaction took place in the absence of catalyst showing the distinct photocatalytic feature of this process.

**Anthracene and olefin oxygenation**

Visible light ($\lambda > 430$ nm) irradiated 9-mesityl-10-methyl-acridinium ion (Acr$^+$–Mes, Scheme 11) and oxygen promote the oxygenation of anthracenes and olefins. Acr$^+$–Mes initiates the reaction with the formation of the electron-transfer state Acr$^-$–Mes$^*$. Subsequently two simultaneous electron transfers from anthracenes (or olefins) to the Mes$^+$ moiety and from Acr$^-$ to O$_2$ take place. The synthesised products from anthracenes (with yields of 99, 46 and 75% for Me$_2$An, MeAn and An, respectively) are epideoxyanthracenes. The reached quantum yields in the processes represented in Scheme 11 are rather high, ranging from 62 to 91%. Anthrone and anthraquinone derivatives are formed for long-lasting runs. In Fig. 12 the trends of reagent and products are showed in the case of anthracene.

As far as the oxygenation of olefins is concerned they can be converted to dioxetanes and, upon prolonged irradiation times, ketone derivatives.

**6 Conclusion and outlook**

This feature article, in which only some of the several works concerning photocatalytic selective reactions are summarized briefly, shows that photocatalysis can be applied as a green synthetic route in organic chemistry.
Despite the pervasiveness of a few applications, the controlled use of light to cause chemical reactions is in its infancy. Theoretically the stage was set for dramatic growth in photochemistry when the laser was invented in the early 1960s but in practice commercial applications of laser-based chemistry have proved elusive in the following half century. Photocatalysis is emerging as a potent synthetic route in organic chemistry. Both semiconductors and various organic species can be used as catalysts with increasingly good results in terms of yields and selectivity. Heterogeneous metal oxides catalysts however are more easily recyclable, since they can be simply separated and usually are not readily deactivated or when deactivation occurs it is a reversible process.

The long-term low selectivity issue typical of traditional photochemical processes is being addressed by taking control of the state of excited species. This is done by control of the reaction environment as the medium influences their competition against fast decay of the Franck–Condon excited species. 

As pointed out by Liu and Hammond, “confinement does not necessarily lead to inhibition of reactions of the trapped substrate” and we have discussed elsewhere why photocatalytic processes need to be made cheaper. Employ-ment of sunlight is of course an option even if solar photons, as Archimedes first showed some twenty-three centuries ago, need to be concentrated, especially in scaled up processes. Yet, mimicking Nature’s photosynthesis as a route to harness solar photons for use in conventional synthesis seems most promising. When this will be accomplished, rapid global spread of photochemical synthesis will take place. By highlighting some of the principles of photocatalysis emerging from current research, the aim of this article is to accelerate this evolution.

Acknowledgements

G. P. is grateful to Prof. Tullio Caronna of Dipartimento di Ingegneria Industriale – Università degli Studi di Bergamo (Italy) for his valuable assistance and to the whole “Schiavello-Grillone” Photocatalysis Group of Dipartimento di Ingegneria Chimica dei Processi e dei Materiali – Università degli Studi di Palermo (Italy). The financial support from MIUR (Rome) and from the Quality College del CNR is gratefully acknowledged.

References


